

PRESIDENT Rob McKenna Washington Attorney General

PRESIDENT-ELECT
Doug Gansler
Maryland Attorney General

VICE PRESIDENT

J.B. Van Hollen

Wisconsin Attorney General

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT Roy Cooper North Carolina Attorney General

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
James McPherson

September 16, 2011

Mr. Samuel Fifer Counsel for Backpage.Com, LLC SNR Denton US 233 South Wacker Drive Suite 7800 Chicago, IL 60606-6306

Mr. Fifer,

On August 31st, 2011, we sent to you a sign-on letter by forty five Attorneys General regarding Backpage.com's assurances, both public and in private, concerning the company's facilitation of the sexual exploitation of children, and prostitution. Since that time, a number of Attorneys General have asked to join their colleagues in supporting this issue, therefore, attached is the revised letter which includes their signatures. Thus, a total of fifty one Attorneys General have signed onto the August 31st letter.

Sincerely,

James E. McPherson Executive Director

2030 M Street, NW Eighth Floor Washington, DC 20036 Phone: (202) 326-6000 http://www.naag.org/



PRESIDENT Rob McKenna Washington Attorney General

PRESIDENT-ELECT Doug Gansler Maryland Attorney General

VICE PRESIDENT

J.B. Van Hollen

Wisconsin Attorney General

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT Roy Cooper North Carolina Attorney General

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
James McPherson

2030 M Street, NW Eighth Floor Washington, DC 20036 Phone: (202) 326-6000 http://www.naag.org/ September 16, 2011

Mr. Samuel Fifer Counsel for Backpage.Com, LLC SNR Denton US 233 South Wacker Drive Suite 7800 Chicago, IL 60606-6306

Re: Backpage.com's ongoing failure to effectively limit prostitution and sexual trafficking activity on its website

Mr. Fifer:

This letter is in response to Backpage.com's assurances, both public and in private, concerning the company's facilitation of the sexual exploitation of children, and prostitution. As our state's chief law enforcement officers, we are increasingly concerned about human trafficking, especially the trafficking of minors. Backpage.com is a hub for such activity.

While Backpage.com professes to have undertaken efforts to limit advertisements for prostitution on its website, particularly those soliciting sex with children, such efforts have proven ineffective. In May, for example, a Dorchester, Massachusetts man was charged for forcing a 15-year-old girl into a motel to have sex with various men for \$100 to \$150 an hour. To find customers, the man posted a photo of the girl on Backpage.com. He was later found with \$19,000 in cash. In another example, prosecutors in Washington state are handling a case in which teen girls say they were coerced, threatened and extorted by two adults who marketed them on Backpage.com.

We have tracked more than 50 instances, in 22 states over three years, of charges filed against those trafficking or attempting to traffic minors on Backpage.com. These are only the stories that made it into the news; many more instances likely exist. These cases often involve runaways ensnared by adults seeking to make money by sexually exploiting them. In some cases, minors are pictured in advertisements. In others, adults are pictured but minors are substituted at the "point of sale" in a grossly illegal transaction.

Nearly naked persons in provocative positions are pictured in nearly every adult services advertisement on Backpage.com and the site requires advertisements for escorts, and other similar "services," to include hourly rates. It does not require forensic training to understand that these advertisements are for prostitution. This hub for illegal services has proven particularly enticing for those seeking to sexually exploit minors.

In a meeting with the Washington State Attorney General's Office, Backpage.com vice president Carl Ferrer acknowledged that the company identifies more than 400 "adult services" posts every month that may involve minors. This figure indicates the extent to which the trafficking of minors occurs on the site – the actual number of minors exploited through Backpage.com may be far greater. The company's figures, along with real world experience, demonstrate the extreme difficulty of excising a particularly egregious crime – the sexual exploitation of minors – on a site seemingly dedicated to the promotion of prostitution.

On a regional basis, there has been no change in postings for prostitution services on Backpage.com. For example, between July 28 and August 1, the Missouri Attorney General's Office on behalf of the Attorneys General Working Group conducted a review of adult content on Backpage.com. This review revealed numerous daily postings for "escort" services in the Adult>Escorts section. On Sunday, July 31, in the St. Louis-area alone, there were one hundred and three (103) new postings for such services. Other regional examples include:

- On August 1, the Washington State Attorney General's Office found one hundred and forty two (142) advertisements that are obviously for prostitutes in the Seattle area; and
- On August 2, even the Connecticut State Attorney General's Office found advertisements for prostitutes in the Connecticut area on the Springfield, Massachusetts and Rhode Island pages, circumventing Backpage.com's omission of a Connecticut adult section.

Missouri investigators further confirmed that Backpage.com's review procedures are ineffective in policing illegal activity. On July 28 and July 29, investigators flagged twenty five (25) new postings advertising prostitution in the St. Louis, Kansas City, Springfield, Columbia, and Jefferson City areas. By August 1, at least four days later, only five of these postings, or less than a quarter, had been removed.

The prominence of illegal content on Backpage.com conflicts with the company's representations about its content policies. Backpage.com claims that it "is committed to preventing those who are intent on misusing the site for illegal purposes." To that end, Backpage.com represents that it has "implemented strict content policies to prevent illegal activity," and that the company has "inappropriate ad content removed." Backpage.com also requires those who post "adult services" advertisements to click a link indicating they agree not to "post any solicitation directly or in 'coded' fashion for any illegal service exchanging sexual favors for money or other valuable consideration." However, a cursory look at a relevant section demonstrates that this guideline is not enforced.

In fact, in a meeting with the Washington State Attorney General's Office, Village Voice Media Board Member Don Moon readily admitted that prostitution advertisements regularly appear on Backpage.com. This shows that the stated representations about the site are in direct

¹ Backpage.com, Safety and Security Enhancements, http://blog.backpage.com/ (last visited August 05, 2011).

² *Id*.

³ See Backpage.com, Posting Rules,

http://posting.seattle.backpage.com/gyrobase/classifieds/PostAdPPI.html/sea/posting.seattle.backpage.com/?section=4381&categ ory=4443&u=sea&serverName=posting.seattle.backpage.com&superRegion=Seattle (last visited August 05, 2011)...

⁴ See Backpage.com, Seattle Escorts, http://seattle.backpage.com/FemaleEscorts/ (last visited August 05, 2011).

conflict with the reality of Backpage's business model: making money from a service illegal in every state, but for a few counties in Nevada.

Based on an independent assessment by the AIM Group, Backpage.com's estimated annual revenue from its adult services section is approximately \$22.7 million. This figure, along with information you provided to the Working Group, indicates that Backpage.com devotes only a fraction of the revenue generated from its adult section advertisements to manual content review. We believe Backpage.com sets a minimal bar for content review in an effort to temper public condemnation, while ensuring that the revenue spigot provided by prostitution advertising remains intact. Though you have stated "all new ads are moderated by a staff member," there appear to be no changes in the volume of prostitution advertisements resulting from this "moderation."

As a practical matter, it is likely very difficult to accurately detect underage human trafficking on Backpage.com's adult services section, when to an outside observer, the website's sole purpose seems to be to advertise prostitution. That is why Craigslist's decision to shut down its adult services section was applauded as a clear way for it to eradicate advertising on its website that trafficked children for prostitution. It is also why we have called on Backpage.com to take similar action.

Furthermore, in lieu of a subpoena, the Working Group asks that Backpage.com provide additional information so that we may better understand the company's policies and practices. As noted earlier, Backpage.com represents that it has "strict content policies to prevent illegal activity." We ask that Backpage.com substantiate this claim by:

- 1. Describing in detail Backpage.com's understanding of what precisely constitutes "illegal activity," including whether Backpage.com contends that advertisements for prostitution services do not constitute advertisements for "illegal activity;"
- 2. Providing a copy of such policies, including but not limited to the specific criteria used to determine whether an advertisement may involve illegal activity;
- 3. Providing the list of the prohibited terms for which Backpage.com is screening;
- 4. Describing in detail the individualized or hand review process undertaken by Backpage.com, including the number of personnel currently assigned to conduct such review;
- 5. Stating the number of advertisements in its adult section, including all subsections, submitted since September 1, 2010;
- 6. Stating the number of advertisements, in its adult section, including all subsections, submitted since September 1, 2010, which were subjected to individualized or hand review prior to publication; and
- 7. Stating the number of advertisements in its adult section, including all subsections, submitted since September 1, 2010, rejected *prior to* publication because they involved or were suspected to involve illegal activity.

.

⁵ Letter from Samuel Fifer, Attorney, SNR Denton, to Attorneys General Working Group (Jan. 27, 2011).

⁶ Backpage.com, *supra* note 1.

Backpage.com's further represents that it has "inappropriate ad content removed." We ask that Backpage.com substantiate this claim by:

- 8. Describing the criteria used to determine whether a published advertisement should be removed due to actual or suspected illegal activity;
- 9. Providing a copy of such policies that detail the criteria used to determine whether a published advertisement should be removed due to actual or suspected illegal activity;
- 10. Describing in detail the criteria Backpage.com uses, including but not limited to the number of user reports required, before a published advertisement is subjected to further review;
- 11. Providing a copy of such policies that detail the criteria Backpage.com uses, including but not limited to the number of user reports required, before a published advertisement is subjected to further review;
- 12. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 in its adult section, including all subsections, that Backpage.com has subjected to post publication review;
- 13. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 in its adult section, including all subsections, that Backpage.com removed following post publication review;
- 14. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 in its adult section, including all subsections, that Backpage.com *did not* remove following post publication review;
- 15. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 that were not subjected to further review by Backpage.com despite the receipt of user reports.

Lastly, Backpage.com also represents that it is "partnering with law enforcement and safety advocates/experts." We request that Backpage.com support this assertion by:

- 16. Identifying the specific "law enforcement [agencies] and safety advocates/experts" with whom Backpage.com has partnered and describing the actions taken by Backpage.com in connection with such partnerships;
- 17. Stating the number of advertisements submitted since September 1, 2010 that Backpage.com has reported pre-publication to local, state or federal law enforcement agencies, or to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children's Cyber Tipline, because of actual or suspected illegal activity;
- 18. Stating the number of user reports of suspected exploitation of minors and/or human trafficking Backpage.com requires before subjecting a published advertisement to further review;
- 19. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 that Backpage.com removed in response to such user reports;
- 20. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 that Backpage.com reported to local, state or federal law enforcement agencies, or to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children's Cyber Tipline, as a result of such reports; and

⁸ Backpage.com, *supra* note 1.

⁷ Backpage.com, *supra* note 1.

21. Stating the number of published advertisements posted since September 1, 2010 that Backpage.com *did not* remove following a review prompted by user reports.

The National Association of Attorneys General requests Backpage.com's response on or

before September 14, 2011.	
Respectfully,	
George Jepsen Attorney General of Connecticut Rob McKenna Attorney General of Washington	Chris Koster Attorney General of Missouri Luther Strange Alabama Attorney General
John J. Burns	Republic hother Ripley Ja. Fepulea'i Arthur Ripley Jr.
Alaska Attorney General	American Samoa Attorney General
Tom Horne	Dustin McDaniel
Arizona Attorney General	Arkansas Attorney General
Hamale J.	John W. Suthers
Kamala Harris	John W. Suthers
California Attorney General	Colorado Attorney General
Joseph R. "Beau" Biden III	Pamela Jo Bondi
Delaware Attorney General	Florida Attorney General
Sul S. Olema	
Sam Olens Georgia Attorney General	Lenny Rápadas Guam Attorney General
deorgia Attorney derieral	dualif Attorney deficial
\$ 9070e	Herdinand
David Louie Hawaii Attorney General	Lawrence Wasden Idaho Attorney General
Lisa Madigan	Greg Zoeller
Illinois Attorney General	Indiana Attorney General

Jon Millar	Denk Schmidt
Tom Miller	Derek Schmidt
Iowa Attorney Ganeral	Kansas Attorney General
	(X) LOGARIA Colder)
Jell Onway	Igni Whay allice
Jack Conway	Lames "Buddy" Caldwell
Kentucky Attorney General	Louisiana Attorney General
	1) for Moule
William J. Schneider	Douglas F. Gansler
Maine Attorney General	Maryland Attorney General
→	8-15/5
Martin Coulley	Dell Schuelle
Martha Coakley	Bill Schuette
Massachusetts Attorney General	Michigan Attorney General
/ . <i>C</i>	1 i the set
Lei Juasan	1) um th and
Lori Swanson	Jin Hood
Minnesota Attorney General	(Mi ssi ssippi Attorney General
1 Bull	(Jon / Cruning_
Steve Bullock	Jon Bruning, Summ
Montana Attorney General	Nebraska Attorney General
1 1 -1	
(Subarine / 12t, TV / WID)	Mike III Value
Catherine Cortez Masto	Michael Delaney
Nevada Attorney General	New Hampshire Attorney General
	21
X and the second	Dan K
Paula T. Dow	Gary King
New Jersey Attorney General	New Mexico Attorney General
$\mathcal{L}_{\mathcal{L}}}}}}}}}}$	1 Con Copyel
Eric Schneiderman	Roy Cooper
New York Attorney General	North Carolina Attornex General
21.0	10010 Ayuda
the 2 mg	My no voccy nuc
Edward T. Buckingham	Wayne Stenehjem
Northern Mariana Islands	North Dakota Attorney General
purases De way	Cath Kiith
Mike Dewine	Scott Pruitt
Ohio Attorney General	Oklahoma Attorney General

	\nearrow
John Kroger	Linda L. Kelly
Oregon Attorney General	Pennsylvania Attorney General
Peter F. Kilmartin	Alan Wilson
Rhode Island Attorney General	South Carolina Attorney General
Marty J. Jackley Jrelley	Robert E. Cooper, JR.
South Dakotă Attorney General Greg Abbott	Tennessee Attorney General Mark Shurtleff
Texas Attorney General	Utah Attorney General
William Forself	Len (=
William H. Sorrell	Kenneth T. Cuccinelli, II
Vermont Attorney General	Virginia Attorney General
Frigury a Parleips	
Greg Phillips	

Wyoming Attorney General